

Review Essay: Evangelization and Cultural Identities in Spanish America (1598-Present)

Andrango-Walker, Catalina. *El símbolo católico indiano (1598) de Luis Jerónimo de Oré. Saberes coloniales y los problemas de la evangelización en la región andina*. Madrid: Iberoamericana/Vervuert, 2018. 237 pp. ISBN 9788-4169-2290-1.

Nogar, Anna M. *Quill and Cross in the Borderlands: Sor María de Ágreda and the Lady in Blue, 1628 to the Present*. Notre Dame, IN: U of Notre Dame P, 2018. ix-xv + 457 pp. ISBN 9780-2681-0213-5.

In *El símbolo católico indiano (1598) de Luis Jerónimo de Oré. Saberes coloniales y los problemas de la evangelización en la región andina* (2018), Catalina Andrango-Walker establishes Oré's *Símbolo* as an overlooked yet valuable resource on early modern viceregal Perú. In four chapters, she considers the *Símbolo* as a response to the Third Lima Council (1582-1583) and José de Acosta's *Historia natural y moral* (1590), and its intertextuality with other contemporary and classical texts. In addition, she examines Oré's didactic strategies for converting the natives, pointing out how he uses this evangelical pedagogy to covertly criticize aspects of viceregal political and ecclesiastic administration. But whereas Latin Americanists have understood the *Símbolo* as merely another catechization manual, Andrango-Walker rescues its contributions to pre-Hispanic and colonial Andean history and geography, largely by underscoring Oré's claim that evangelization efforts in Perú were ineffective due to administrative corruption and bureaucratic inefficacy rather than the natives' alleged savagery and lack of civilization. Consequently, Andrango-Walker's analysis reveals more broadly "la identidad del criollo en pleno proceso de construcción" (194).

Andrango-Walker anchors her analysis in a methodology not unlike that of Juan Vitulli, who privileges a work's original context in order to achieve accurate, nuanced literary and historical analyses. Accordingly, Andrango-Walker investigates Oré as a multifaceted individual who moved in several cultural and geographical spheres: "como letrado capaz de debatir con sus pares europeos y de superarlos en conocimiento, como autoridad promotora de la cultura europea entre los nativos y como representante de una incipiente comunidad letrada local que ya comenzaba a manifestarse a finales del siglo XVI." This approach offers scholars "un mejor entendimiento de la interacción de este sujeto criollo con el poder colonial al que contesta y a la vez apoya" (23).

In chapter 1 Andrango-Walker describes how the Third Lima Council impacted the *Símbolo*'s contents and publication. The Council was convened in part to investigate why evangelization was much less successful in Perú than expected. Church officials acknowledged several problems: there was no uniform pedagogy and the recently converted were thus confused about basic doctrine; clergy members in the field could not speak indigenous languages and had little knowledge of indigenous cultures; and there was rampant ecclesiastic and administrative corruption. The laudatory poems and prefaces to Oré's book emphasize its contribution to improving evangelization techniques through the author's expertise, experience, and religious fervor. Oré furthermore implies that he wrote the book at the behest of his superiors—a rhetorical strategy that perhaps facilitated the approval process, since Oré includes pre-Hispanic history and criticism that was beyond the scope of a manual for evangelization.

Chapter 2 deals with the influence of contemporary historiography on Oré's work. Oré takes up the theory of the five zones, which European intellectuals had used to argue that the natives were savages. Rather than disproving this theory, Oré uses it to demonstrate that the tropics

are capable of producing intelligent beings (both indigenous peoples and criollos) with organized, advanced societies. He thus undermines the natural slave justification for Spanish domination. But rather than denying the Spanish right to rule in the colonies, he justifies their presence with the Providential argument: God had led the explorers and conquistadors to the New World in order to bring Christianity to the indigenous peoples.

Beyond demonstrating his thorough knowledge of early modern historiography, Oré establishes his authority to write about Andean indigenous culture and history through his knowledge of European historiographic methodologies and his experience traveling throughout the viceroyalty while catechizing the native population. During his extensive travels, he interviewed native informants in order to compile and record their oral histories in what he considered proper historiographical format. Writing a pre-Hispanic history of the natives enables Oré to describe their advanced culture and civilization and thus undermine the commonplace that they were mere savages. The text also subtly criticizes conquistadors' violence by narrating the pain they inflicted upon native peoples, even as the natives remained open to conversion. Andrango-Walker creatively labels this rhetorical strategy "crítica-alabanza": Oré criticizes Peninsular bureaucracy while still supporting its overall position. Andrango-Walker identifies many instances of this same strategy throughout Oré's work. In chapter 3, for example, she examines Oré's description his family—mostly comprised of priests and nuns—as model Catholics who were exemplars not only for newly indoctrinated natives, but also for the Spanish clergy whose motivation for moving to Perú was financial rather sacred.

The final chapter offers a close reading of two *cánticos* written in Quechua but structured and sung according to Catholic tradition, which Oré used to teach doctrine to the indigenous population. Oré believed that the indigenous people were mentally capable of understanding doctrine but lacked the cultural referents necessary for indoctrination to be effective; thus, he took advantage of parallels between Andean and Catholic religious practices to build a more effective praxis. By the same token, Oré made sure to undermine or de-mystify Andean beliefs while offering parallel Catholic beliefs as proper replacements. Based on her análisis of this technique, Andrango-Walker concludes that "el despliegue en un performance que constituye una mimesis de los rituales de la cultura hegemónica son una prueba de la imposibilidad de dejar de lado el contexto local y la religión prehispánica. Al mismo tiempo, esto muestra la imposibilidad de asimilar completamente al sujeto andino a los ideales del colonizador" (190).

Following the four main chapters are appendices with two letters that Oré wrote toward the end of his life when he was bishop of La Concepción. These documents highlight the priest's work as a missionary and as an ecclesiastical administrator, rather than as the intellectual that we see in the *Símbolo*. It is the first time these letters have been published in their entirety (David Noble Cook provides only excerpts in a 2008 article), and will therefore be of great use to those who study Oré, scholars who examine colonial celebrations, Marianologists, or historians of ecclesiastical administration.

Andrango-Walker's nuanced analysis of Oré's *Símbolo* is thoroughly grounded in knowledge of the political and intellectual context in which it was produced, while taking into account extant criticism on Oré. It is of broad interest to scholars working on early modern Perú, intellectual history, topics related to catechization, and Luis Jerónimo de Oré. It is a welcome addition to early modern scholarship on Latin America.

Anna M. Nogar's text, by contrast, contemplates Sor María, a Spanish nun from Ágreda, Spain, who was well-known during the seventeenth century for her bilocations to the New Spanish borderlands, where she proselytized to the Jumano tribe. She was famous as well for her Marian